FILIPINO PENTECOSTALISM IN A GLOBAL CONTEXT

Elijah Jong Fil Kim

1. Introduction

The Pentecostal/Charismatic (P/C) movements have drawn worldwide attention in the twentieth century as global phenomena. Few other religious movements can be compared to the way the P/C movements have impacted the global village, with their vast differences and similarities, from continent to continent and nation to nation. Because the Philippines is located in Southeast Asia on the Pacific Rim, there are both Asiatic similarities and differences in Pentecostal and Charismatic phenomena. There are 313 million adherents of the Christian religion, of which there are 199 million professing Christians and 135 million Pentecostal/Charismatics, out of a total population of 3,697 million, ¹ indicating that classic Pentecostals in Asia are the smallest group out of the three P/C groupings. It is inevitable that there are Asiatic geographical, historical and cultural connections and commonalities between Filipino P/C movements and those of neighboring countries. As far as similarities are concerned in terms of the socio-religious and historical context, the Philippines shares many more similarities with Latin America than with other Asian countries, although the writer admits that there are great differences between the two regions when subjected to microscopic investigation.

According to Johnstone's statistics, the growth of Evangelicals in Latin America in the twentieth century has been spectacular. In 1900 they numbered about 700,000, or 1% of the population, and by 2000 had multiplied to 55 million. Remarkably, among Evangelicals, Pentecostals have demonstrated the greatest vigor and have become the largest

¹ David B. Barrett, George T. Kurian, and Todd M. Johnson, eds., *World Christian Encyclopedia: A Comparative Survey of Churches and Religions in the Modern World*, rev. ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), vol. 1, p. 13.

component of Evangelicalism in Latin America with over 32 million affiliates, which constitute 28% of the world's Pentecostals. Whether Latin American Pentecostalism was derived from local revivals within historic Protestant churches or from the work of foreign Pentecostal missionary individuals or agencies, both vital components of local origins and global connectedness should be taken note of, and such is also the case in the Philippines. 3

Historically, the Protestant Reformation in Europe and the colonial expansion of Spain and Portugal in Latin America are contemporary events relevant to the Philippines as well. Spain and Portugal, on the one hand, were symbols of the Counter Reformation in Europe, and ideas viewed as heterodox by Roman Catholicism were systematically eradicated throughout the Latin American colonial era, just as in the Philippines. Within the Iberian colonial territories, Protestantism was conceived of as a heresy threatening the ideological and political integrity of a composite socio-political totality which had been established with Catholic Christianity as a model. The same was the case in the Philippines in the Spanish colonial period. Protestantism met fanatical opposition to its efforts to establish Protestant missionary activities in the Philippines during the Spanish colonial era, and this was also the case in Latin America.

The reason that P/C churches achieved such remarkable growth in both Latin America and the Philippines is because of a reciprocal interaction of the double-structured religious system in the dominant religion of Roman Catholicism. On the other hand, South Korean and Southeast Asian P/C growth remained in a different religious context from the former because there was no dominant Catholicism in the region, and

² Patrick Johnstone and Jason Mandryk, eds., *Operation World 21st Century Edition* (Cumbria: Paternoster, 2001), pp. 29-38.

³ Sergio Matviuk, "Pentecostal Leadership Development and Church Growth in Latin America," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 5:1 (2002), pp. 137-54 (153).

⁴ For Catholic response and reaction to the Reformation, see John McManners, ed., *The Oxford Illustrated History of Christianity* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), pp. 301-305.

⁵ Jean-Pierre Bastian, "Protestantism in Latin America," in *The Church in Latin America 1492-1992*, ed. Enrique Dussel (Kent: Burns & Oates, 1992), pp. 313-50 (314).

⁶ William R. Read, *New Patterns of Church Growth in Brazil* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1965), p. 11.

the respective countries were not able to have the same double-structured religious system. In Latin America and the Philippines, the P/C impact by means of personal conversions where nominal Catholic individuals encountered God directly through prayer and Bible reading activities, including numerous house Bible studies, brought many people to experiences of healing, exorcism and baptism in the Holy Spirit. As a result, Catholics could break out of the trappings of the religious system dominated by the upper level of Catholicism. On the other hand, the constituents of the P/C movements could maintain their popular and folk religiosity from the lower, poor and marginalized levels. However, though South Korean and Southeast Asian cases have similarities to the Philippines and Latin America, they are very different due to different folk/popular Catholicism of the Philippines and Latin America, while South Korea and Southeast Asia have traditional folk/popular religions such as animism and shamanism.

Church growth in some countries like Korea, the Philippines and India in Asia, and Chile, Guatemala, Brazil, and Argentina in Latin America resulted from classic Pentecostal revival movements. Indian revivals that broke out among the Church Missionary Society and the Mar Thoma Church in 1860, 1873 and 1895 in Travancore, the Malabar Coast appeared much earlier than the Azusa Street Revival. Some revivals resulted in local church growth such as in South Korea, Chile, Myanmar, Indonesia, Brazil, Vietnam and the Philippines. Other revivals in India and Japan did not expand the movement to a nationwide level.

After the Manila Pentecostal Revival broke out in the 1950s, a tremendous change in the history of the churches in the Philippines took place by the spread of revivals, the rapid growth of Pentecostal churches, multiplied church plantings, the emergence of Independent/Indigenous churches with a new influx of neo-Pentecostal movements and the Third Wave's movements. Divergent P/C churches made Greater Metro Manila

⁷ Karl-Wilhelm Westmeier, *Protestant Pentecostalism in Latin America: A Study in the Dynamics of Missions* (Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 1999), p. 105, referring to his book, *Reconciling Heaven and Earth*, states that these changes in Latin America can be applicable elsewhere in the world.

⁸ A. C. George, "Pentecostal Beginnings in Travancore, South India," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 4:2 (2001), pp. 215-37 (215-21) reports that attendees of three revivals experienced the outpouring of the Holy Spirit with some manifestations, such as speaking in tongues and other gifts, because before the revival took place the people were able to study Baily's Malayalam Bible with a comparatively earlier Bible translation than other Asian countries...

a matrix or religious showcase for the rest of the country to enable the expansion of P/C bodies at nationwide level.

Alvarez introduces Bernardo Campos' idea of Pentecostal revival as a moving force of church growth in Latin America as well and quotes him: "pentecostality as the universal experience that expresses the Pentecostal event (*el acontecimiento Pentecostal*)—the key event that characterizes the life of those who identify themselves with the historical Pentecostal revival" plays a key role in history. The P/C movements in Latin America and the Philippines also show diverse Pentecostal and Charismatic elements, according to Kärkkäinen.

In Latin America the Pentecostal movement has grown not only rapidly but also differently. Springing from a variety of situations and methods, the fertile soil of contemporary crisis and change has led to a broad range of movements, including those that reflect the different aspirations of ethnic groups, those built largely on diverse regions or social classes and those that accommodate diverse doctrinal, polity, and denominational emphases. ¹⁰

This examination of the fertile ground for rapid Pentecostal/ Charismatic growth derived from the Filipino double-structured religious system can, to some extent, be a possible case study in relation to the Latin American religious system. However, there is no doubt that any rapidly growing religious movement in Asia and Latin America is deeply connected to the traditional or local religiosity and spirituality from the lower level of the respective religious systems, just as it is in the Philippines. Pentecostal spirituality has been deeply related to folk/popular religions in Asia, i.e., to animistic beliefs and practices in "supernatural" arenas. Wonsuk Ma points out the same importance of the animistic orientation of Asians as "No matter how modern a society may look, basically Asian minds are animistic in orientation."

⁹ Miguel Alvarez, "The South and the Latin American Paradigm of the Pentecostal Movement," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 5:1 (2002), pp. 135-53 (137-38).

¹⁰ Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, "'Culture, Contextualization, and Conversion': Missiological Reflections from the Catholic-Pentecostal Dialogue (1990-1997)," *Asian Journal of Mission* 2:2 (2000), pp. 261-75 (272).

¹¹ Wonsuk Ma, "Asian (Classical) Pentecostalism: Theology in Context" (paper presented at the International Conference on Asian Pentecostalism, Fircroft College, Birmingham, September 2001), p. 7, subsequently published as part of Allan Anderson and Edmond Tang, eds., *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia* (Oxford: Regnum Books; Baguio: APTS Press, 2005).

Harvey Cox also points out the significance of this kind of primal religion, with the spirituality of traditional beliefs and practices contributing to the rapid growth of P/C movements. ¹² Because most Asians and Latin Americans are familiar with miracles, prayer for healing, trance, vision and exorcism, the primal religiosity provides opportunity to incorporate P/C manifestations much more easily than Westerners, who have been accustomed to highly organized religions, secularized societies and rationalized worldviews. Hwa Yung agrees with this opinion regarding the reason for the acceptability and receptivity of P/C phenomena by Asians as follows:

The picture in the non-western world was rather different. Most non-westerners possess a supernaturalistic worldview, which even a modern western scientific education could not fully eradicate easily. It is so much part and parcel of their cultural backgrounds. Consequently, a truly indigenous Christianity in Asia has to be supernaturalistic, and therefore Pentecostal!¹³

In addition, the numerical growth of P/C movements in Latin America has resulted from spiritual factors, anthropological reasons, sociological elements, pastoral methodology, psychological factors and cultural factors, which resemble the situation in the Philippines and elsewhere in Asia as well.¹⁴

The writer tries to situate several socio-religious elements of Filipino Pentecostal characteristics such as immigration, the importance of the ethnic periphery, the relationship between older Protestant and Pentecostal churches, the degree of some inspirited culture, the American influence,

¹² Harvey Cox, Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-First Century (London: Cassell, 1996), pp. 100-105.

¹³ Hwa Yung, "Pentecostalism and the Asian Church" (paper presented at the International Conference on Asian Pentecostalism, Fircroft College, Birmingham, September 2001), p. 11, subsequently published as part of Allan Anderson and Edmond Tang, eds., *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia* (Oxford: Regnum Books; Baguio: APTS Press, 2005).

¹⁴ Samuel Escobar, "Latin America: An Evangelical Perspective," *Missiology: An International Review* 20:2 (1992), pp. 241-53 (247) lists factors of the growth of the P/C movements: 1) spiritual factors (the free action of the Spirit); 2) anthropological reasons (hunger for God); 3) sociological elements (providing a sure sense of shelter, security and community in a hostile world); 4) pastoral methodology (lay participation); 5) psychological factors (freedom of worship and emotion); and 6) cultural factors (the use of folk music and instruments).

urbanization and modernization, functional equivalents of religions, and political and apolitical issues into a global context, especially in comparison with South Korea in general, and Southeast Asia in particular when necessary, and generally compares these with Latin America in the following sections.

Domestic immigrants from various places in the Philippines came to Greater Metro Manila and made the metropolitan area a melting pot of ethnic and religious complexity with folk/popular beliefs and practices. The commonality and continuity of ancient religious beliefs and practices are retained within folk/popular Catholicism. For instance, the Visayan migrant generally comes to Manila by the inter-island boats which dock at the North Harbor, Tondo. The resultant homogeneity in language blunts the edges of any differences perceived as arising from ethnic-regional backgrounds. 15 Many of these migrants from different parts of the country who had experienced the "Pentecostal Revival" were able to go back to their home provinces with the Pentecostal message and an intensive itinerant program, producing its further expansion from urban Metro Manila to rural areas. 16 Their enthusiastic counter-immigration to their hometowns in rural areas had a great impact on evangelism and church planting. And, the emergence of strong Filipino leadership by means of inter-immigration contributed to rapid nationwide growth.

As in the Philippines, the expansion of P/C movements in South Korea, Southeast Asia and Latin America has shown a similarly significant urban and mega-city centered character rather than that of sporadically scattered rural missions, concentrated by a number of Protestant/Evangelical denominations and mission agencies for the isolated ethnic and cultural minority groups. One example in Brazil, the growth of Congregação Cristã do Brasil (CCB), which has usually been a self-propagating, self-governing, self-supporting and lay-leading denomination since its inception by Luigi Francescon has been affected by

¹⁵ Residents in Inner Tondo quickly become bilingual, but their children, born in Tondo, grow up identifying themselves with their parents' mother tongue. Mary Racelis Hollnsteiner, "Inner Tondo as a Way of Life," in *Acculturation in the Philippines: Essays on Changing Societies, a Selection of Papers Presented at the Baguio Religious Acculturation Conferences from 1958 to 1968*, eds. Peter G. Gowing and William Henry Scott (Quezon City: New Day Publishers, 1971), pp. 235-45 (239).

¹⁶ Arthur Leonard Tuggy and Ralph. E. Toliver, *Seeing the Church in the Philippines* (Manila: OMF Literature, 1972), p. 81.

¹⁷ Tuggy & Toliver, Seeing the Church in the Philippines, pp. 83-84.

rural-urban immigration.¹⁸ Sergio Matviuk acknowledges these important commonalities and similarities in relation to the immigration factor of the Filipino P/C movements in comparison to the Latin American context as follows:

Many of the scholarly works on Latin American Pentecostal growth in Latin American Pentecostalism affirm that Pentecostal growth in Latin America is related and is a consequence of social phenomena such as people's migration from rural areas to urban areas, poverty and popular religiosity's growth. But there has been almost no theoretical work directed to establish a model of analysis that provides a framework to understand what dimensions of the local culture have been integrated with Pentecostal beliefs to foster the tremendous growth of Latin American Pentecostalism.¹⁹

2. The Issues of Ethnography

There is no doubt that P/C movements are deeply interrelated with migrants from rural areas in the Philippines, Southeast Asia, South Korea and even in Latin America. Some early missionaries and returning believers from mega-cities who had experienced Pentecostal revivals as urban migrants brought back P/C messages to establish satellite house churches and ministries in their hometowns when they returned there or were commissioned to do so by their churches. Although there are a number of missionaries who are trying to spread Pentecostal movements in the remote areas directly, the expansion and rapid growth of Pentecostalism has been developed much more remarkably in the Philippines. Urban Pentecostal churches have dispatched a number of local missionaries strategically in cooperation with denominations, para-church organizations and even overseas-based mission agencies. Rural ethnicity and tradition lead them to be involved in much deeper and broader Pentecostal spiritual ministries than those in urban areas in the Philippines, due to a common shared understanding of the animistic and spirit world worldview.

One should not neglect the racial and ethnic stereotypes of Latin American ethnography that are different from the context in the Philippines. Alvarez comments on ethnographic complexity there as follows:

¹⁸ Westmeier, *Protestant Pentecostalism in Latin America*, p. 17.

¹⁹ Matviuk, "Pentecostal Leadership Development," pp. 155-56.

It is well known that Pentecostals in the region comprise a vast community with different expressions across the continent. Hence, the movement has been affected historically by a rich and multicolored tapestry of race, language and geography including history and politics.²⁰

3. Pentecostalism's Relationship to Older Protestantism

In Greater Metro Manila in 1972, the fastest growing churches were Pentecostal; whereas older Protestant churches were steadily declining. However, they were united in standing against repression and dictatorship. 21 Bautista pointed out that the decline of old Protestant churches resulted from the lack of enthusiastic evangelism.²² In 1974, the UCCP General Assembly approved a moratorium on new missionaries. Newer P/C missionaries and church leaders aggressively expanded their religious territories by means of dynamic evangelism without any connection to the UCCP. The CAMACOP, CFGP, PGCAG and JIL and many other Pentecostal independent/indigenous churches exhibited rapid and dramatic growth, proving entirely consistent with the picture of Evangelical/Pentecostal expansion in the Philippines. 23 Most newer and younger independent/indigenous P/C churches do not have any direct links with foreign denominational bodies, or the traditional and ecumenical older Philippine Protestant denominations. Rather, they have continued to be self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating.²

²⁰ Typical characteristics of Latin Americans have been closely related to the growth of P/C movements. Alvarez, "The South and the Latin American Paradigm of the Pentecostal Movement," pp. 138-39.

²¹ For that reason, the Protestant pastors and workers from the NCCP were arrested, tortured and even executed; the others were placed behind bars. Oscar S. Suarez, *Protestantism and Authoritarian Politics: The Politics of Repression and the Future of Ecumenical Witness in the Philippines* (Quezon City: New Day, 1999), pp. 1-3.

²² Lorenzo C. Bautista, "The Church in Philippines," in *Church in Asia Today*, ed. Saphir Athyal (Singapore: Asia Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization, 1996), pp. 169-95 (185).

²³ Bautista, "The Church in Philippines," pp. 250-51.

²⁴ Alvarez, "The South and the Latin American Paradigm," p. 140.

In Korea, the Pentecostalization of older denominations such as Presbyterian, Methodist, Holiness and Baptist churches can be traced to the origin of "the Korea Pentecost" in 1907 in the Pyongyang Changdaehyun Church revival movement. The entire Korean Protestant church has been affected until now by a strong Pentecostal tradition. However, the general and gradual decline of spiritual zeal and fervor seems to be inevitable in relation to the economic development and political stability in the country today.

The similarly significant and rapidly growing Pentecostal movements among religious pluralistic countries in Southeast Asia such as Myanmar, Thailand, Malaysia, Vietnam and Singapore appear to be a process of the Pentecostalization of the older Protestant denominations. ²⁵ In a similar way in Latin America, when it comes to the identification of the Pentecostal groups with other forms of Protestant Evangelicalism, their differences are inconspicuous because there is a close correlation between Pentecostal and Protestant churches. This closeness shows that Pentecostals make up 75% of the total Protestant population in Latin America. ²⁶ Pentecostals in Latin America, and especially in Chile and Korea, are probably also more "Protestant" than in other places like Africa.

It is worthy to note that local aspects of the Latin American Iberian culture became a fertile soil to foster the development and growth of P/C movements; this case is similar to the Philippines. Matviuk agrees about "the importance of the aspects of the Latin American culture that permeate Latin American Pentecostalism." In Brazil there is a fifth of the world's Pentecostal adherents and proportionally the largest membership on any continent. Peter Wagner points out that the typical fragmenting nature of

²⁵ Allan H. Anderson, "Pentecostalism in East Asia: Indigenous Oriental Christianity?," *Pneuma* 22:1 (2000), pp. 115-32 (117).

According to Douglas Petersen, "The Formation of Popular, National, Autonomous Pentecostal Churches in Central America," *Pneuma* 16:1 (1994), pp. 23-48 (32-33) as he quoted the statistics of C. Peter Wagner, "the Assemblies of God, has become the largest or second largest in denominational membership in Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Costa Rica, Cuba, Dominican Republic, Guatemala, Honduras, Nicaragua, Panama, Peru, Puerto Rico, Uruguay, Venezuela or 13 (excluding Puerto Rico and Portuguese-speaking Brazil) of the 18 Spanish-speaking republics of Latin America."

²⁷ Matviuk, "Pentecostal Leadership Development," p. 162.

Pentecostal churches in Latin America is the major element of church growth. ²⁸

J. Merle Davis, author of *How the Church Grows in Brazil*, describes the distinctive Brazilian church growth as closely connected with varied factors coming from migration, a man's church, emotionalism, social phenomena, women's Bible and home economy training, missionary spirit, lay leadership, open-air evangelism, Brazilian Plan, ²⁹ the American Episcopal Mission to the Japanese, a mission to the intellectuals and undenominational missions. Most of the Pentecostal church growth factors are inter-connectedly matched to Filipino P/C church growth as well.

4. North American Influence

David Martin states that Latin America's underdevelopment was largely a product of its Iberian culture. By embracing the "Anglo" values incorporated in Pentecostalism, Latin Americans acquired the cultural foundation needed for ascending to modernity and development. The Holiness-Methodist-Puritanical Anglo-American value, through "Manifest Destiny," contributed to the growth of P/C movements in the Philippines.

Protestant churches in general, and P/C churches in particular in the Philippines, South Korea, Southeast Asia and Latin America are mostly related to churches in the USA, directly or indirectly. Whereas Protestantism in the said regions, on the one hand, is a direct legacy of its North American counterpart; on the other hand, Pentecostalism in each particular context is a localized or contextualized version of the said

²⁸ C. Peter Wagner, *Look Out! The Pentecostals Are Coming* (Carol Stream, IL: Creation, 1973), p. 26.

²⁹ From 1917 to 1963, each of the Presbyterian Missions and all branches of the Presbyterian Church in Brazil had been operating for evangelism and church planting all over Brazil. See Read, *New Patterns of Church Growth in Brazil*, pp. 84-116.

³⁰ David Martin, *Tongues of Fire: The Expression of Protestantism in Latin America* (Oxford: Prentice-Hall, 1960), pp. 9-46; R. Andrew Chesnut, *Born Again in Brazil: The Pentecostal Boom and the Pathogens of Poverty* (London: Rutgers University Press, 1997), pp. 4-5; Phillip Berryman, *Religion in the Mega City: Catholic and Protestant Portraits from Latin America* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1996), p. 3.

countries, having only an indirect relationship with the USA.³¹ Although Philippine Pentecostalism was influenced by American missionaries and Filipino *balikbayan* missionaries in earlier times, a variety of variations from American Pentecostalism has promulgated peculiar expressions of Filipino Pentecostalism, as is the case in South Korea, Southeast Asia and Latin America.

One example in Korea, Southeast Asia, Latin America and even in the Philippines, is that the number of American missionaries was relatively few in the pre-War era. Since the "Manila Pentecostal revival in the 1950s, an influx of American missionaries, crusaders, evangelists and televangelists to the Philippines has influenced the Philippine archipelago tremendously. This trend made the Protestant churches in general, and Pentecostal churches in particular, theologically, financially, denominationally and doctrinally dependent upon the USA. The context in Latin America is that Central American and Caribbean churches are influenced more by the USA than further in South America, while Korean Pentecostal churches have faced different relations to the USA, which will be discussed later in detail.

The classical Pentecostal denominations in the earlier period in both the Philippines and Latin America were established in collaboration with American missionaries so that they were inevitably dependent on the finances, personnel and denominational relationship of North American churches, but they were able to be independent to some extent in the later stage. There are Indigenous/Independent Pentecostal churches who obviously have no ties to USA denominations and financial support because of the work of dynamic national evangelists and pastors like Eddie Villanueva, national director of Jesus is Lord church, although they have tried to have spiritual and friendly endorsements from USA churches and leaders. Classic Charismatic Pentecostal denominations and churches dependent on the USA financially and doctrinally are struggling to maintain or survive to some extent, yet a great number of independent/indigenous Pentecostal churches are thriving with their

³¹ D. Peterson, "The Formation of Popular, National, Autonomous Pentecostal Churches," p. 29 also agrees with this in relation to Latin American context and culture.

³² D. Peterson, "The Formation of Popular, National, Autonomous Pentecostal Churches," p. 28, also admits this dependency on the USA.

³³ Westmeier, "Protestant Pentecostalism in Latin America," p. 17.

nationalistic characteristics in the Philippines and Latin America. ³⁴ Filipino and Latin American Pentecostal independent leaders, whatever their relationship doctrinally and denominationally with the USA churches, are clearly the only ones who could take initiative in the development of the Pentecostal movements in their regions.

In Korea, these kinds of independent and indigenous Pentecostal churches are very rare, while most Latin American independent churches have shared the case in the Philippines. D. Peterson summarizes this process as follows:

Miguez Bonino's position correctly asserts that Pentecostalism, though having early foreign influences, quickly became indigenous and emerges as an authentic religious and social expression within the Latin American context. Consequently, Pentecostalism cannot be adequately understood within the rubric of the historical projects of the traditional Latin American Protestant movement. Neither can Pentecostalism be understood strictly within the framework of Evangelicalism. 35

In a different way from the Philippines and Latin America, Korea, according to David Martin, "is exposed to religious and cultural radiation from the USA." The influence of American conservative evangelicalism was modified and transformed. As Pentecostalism in Korea has been contextualized and indigenized it has taken a different form from that seen in the USA. 37

5. Modernization and Urbanization

The characteristic of Pentecostal church growth in Brazil has been explained in terms of urbanization, industrialization and internal

³⁷ Allan Anderson, "The Contribution of David Yonggi Cho to a Contextual Theology in Korea," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 12:1 (2003), pp. 87-107 (86) also points out the peculiar way of Korean Pentecostalism that is quite different from the west, mainly from the USA.

 $^{^{34}}$ Westmeier, "Protestant Pentecostalism in Latin America," p. 104, points out "dependence on their foreign funds or personnel has hindered growth."

³⁵ Petersen, "The Formation of Popular, National, Autonomous Pentecostal Churches," pp. 29-30.

³⁶ Martin, *Tongues of Fire*, p. 135.

migration.³⁸ Modernization is defined as the process of social change and transformation that affects an entire society. David Martin relates the tremendous evangelical growth in Latin America to sociological factors. He agrees that Pentecostalism empowers and offers security to the victims of modernization.³⁹ According to Willems, Protestantism, as it was established, began to act in a very limited way as a factor contributing to socio-cultural change. Then industrialization, urbanization, internal migration, and the opening of the rural frontier not only generated conditions increasingly favorable to the growth of Protestant denominations but also gradually reinforced their active role in the process of socio cultural transformation in Brazil and other countries in Latin America.⁴⁰ This situation was similar to the Philippines, though not to many Asian countries such as India, Indonesia, China and Thailand.

The twentieth-century Pentecostal movement began (in a wider sense) in cities and has continued to be at home in urban areas, particularly in the non-Western world where Pentecostal growth and urbanization have seemed to develop side by side. In the Southeast Asian setting, the city reflects many rural patterns of life that have been carried over from the provinces. An anajor characteristic of urbanization in Southeast Asia is the functional dominance, with two minor exceptions, of one great metropolis in each of the countries of the region. These cities have acted as the head-links between the West and the indigenous societies. They are in a

³⁸ According to William R. Read and Frank A. Ineson, *Brazil 1980: The Protestant Handbook* (Monrovia, CA: MARC, 1973), pp. 142-43, Pentecostals in Brazil anticipate that the rapidly expanding road network and increasing tempo of the process of industrialization will continue to move together in the years ahead to penetrate all Brazilian society and to integrate Brazil both physically and economically.

³⁹ Martin, *Tongues of Fire*, p. 65, "...so large a movement, now including about one in six of all Brazilians, has clear political potential. Yet Pentecostal success and the possibility of adherents creating their own free space is predicated on the avoidance of secular entanglements, among which politics are included. Pentecostals are people imbued with hope and with what they discern as 'power', but they have little hope of power through politics." See also Chesnut, *Born Again in Brazil*, pp. 4-5.

⁴⁰ Emillio Willems, Followers of the New Faith: Culture Change and the Rise of Protestantism in Brazil and Chile (Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 1967), p. 13.

⁴¹ Phillip M. Hauser, ed., *Urbanization in Asia and the Far East* (Calcutta: Unesco, 1957); Richard P. Poethig, "The Philippine Urban Family," in *Acculturation in the Philippines*, pp. 222-34.

state of rapid social change, associated with the granting of political autonomy to the former colonial nations, with the accelerated rise of nationalism, and the increasing centralization of political functions in the national capitals.

In the Philippines, the rate of population growth of the cities or urban areas has greatly exceeded that of the rural areas as a whole. Urbanization has proceeded faster than would be justified by the state of economic development. All of the cities are sharing in this growth, but Manila stands out as the focus of this movement. When maintaining traditional religion from rural origins, especially folk Catholicism, settling in urban society in Greater Metro Manila is value orientation of the urban Filipino. ⁴² That is the reason why a new influx of folk Catholicism from most of the provinces, reshaped again in urban settings, became large and strong enough to be the PCCM in greater Metro Manila through domestic migration, urbanization and industrialization.

Industrialization has meant concentration of more factories and related enterprises in Manila, Cebu, Davao, and other centers of population. There has been very little effort toward decentralization of industry. The over-crowding of cities makes it impossible for them to meet the needs of the residents. There are problems of inadequate public services dramatized by traffic jams, overcrowded schools, uncollected garbage, lack of water, and the widening blight of the growing slum sections that breed disease and crime. Definitely, something must be done to enable cities to more effectively meet the demands made upon them by an increasing population. ⁴³

Urbanization contributes in its own way to the expansion of the newer and more independent/indigenous P/C movements. 44 When people feel the loss of communal identity of their origin in rural areas, they come to P/C churches, ensuring for themselves the security of God's love and power.

The Korean case is not exceptional either, as rapid industrialization and urbanization resulted in a sense of deprivation and loss of identity among the migrant urban poor. Poverty, isolation, instability and

⁴² Poethig, "The Philippine Urban Family," p. 228.

⁴³ Robert M. Fukode, "The Impact of Industrialization of the Philippines" (a paper presented at the God's People in Asian Industrial Society, in Kyoto, Japan, May 1966), p. 80.

⁴⁴ Douglas J. Elwood, *Churches and Sects in the Philippines: A Descriptive Study of Contemporary Religious Group Movements*, Silliman University Monograph Series (Religious Studies) 1 (Dumaguete City, Philippines: Silliman University, 1968), p. 65.

hopelessness caused urban people to look for religious security and the divine presence of spiritual manifestation. 45 It is not exaggerated that P/C movements have been perceived by urban people as providing places of spiritual security and personal communities for people unsettled by rapid social change, industrialization, modernization and urbanization in the Philippines, South Korea, Latin America and other parts of the third world. As David Martin agrees, this urbanized context in South Korea produced a great number of Pentecostal-type, mega-churches and Pentecostal expansion.

6. Functional equivalents of culture and religion

According to Westmeier on functional equivalents of culture and religion, functionalists have tried to tie religion to the modernization processes operative in Latin America, and folk religion is forced to progress to more "advanced" stages through phases of secularization. The functionalist researcher will always end up dividing reality into the sacred and the profane." Hence, folk religion has been vigorously contributing to the fastest P/C growth in the Philippines and other Asian countries, mainly deriving from the lower level of the double-structured religious system. Latin American Pentecostalism has almost the same expression of folk religion as in the Philippines. ⁴⁷

Kärkkäinen agrees with this point:

In some parts of the area, Christian churches in general and Pentecostal/Charismatic churches in particular are growing in an amazing way while in most Asian/Pacific countries traditional religions are still in control. 48

⁴⁵ Hong, "Charismatic Mega-churches in Korea," p. 106 points out, "The difficulty of finding a place to belong and loss of identity can make humans more connected to God, placing more demands on the role of religion.... Many people migrating from rural areas to cities usually had animistic religious patterns and affectionate human relations, but experienced the new cold social structures and milieu with culture shock." Martin also states this growth of urbanization provides a fertile soil for Pentecostal growth and development. Also David Martin, *Pentecostalism: The World Their Parish* (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), p. 161.

⁴⁶ Westmeier, *Protestant Pentecostalism in Latin America*, p. 132.

 $^{^{\}rm 47}$ Matviuk, "Pentecostal Leadership Development," p. 170 also argues the vitality of folk religion.

⁴⁸ Kärkkäinen, "Truth on Fire'," p. 36.

Harper gives a glimpse of two regional similarities of folk religion as follows:⁴⁹

Moreover, the rites most characteristic of folk Catholicism as practiced both in Latin America and in the Philippines focus on Mary and the saints, with relatively little concern for Christ, God the Father and the Holy Spirit.

Furthermore, Manuel María Marzal, SJ, specifies four types of Latin American popular religion, when he was corresponding to Ribeiro's four groups that are classified as syncretic Catholicism, ⁵⁰ Mestizo Catholicism, ⁵¹ transplanted Catholicism, ⁵² and emergent popular religion. ⁵³ However, the combination of folk/popular religiosity and P/C spirituality resulted in ongoing controversy about syncretism in Latin America and Asia, especially in the Philippines. Traditionally, Asians and Latin Americans have been accustomed to animism and shamanism, beliefs in supernatural power and the spirit world, healing and blessings for a long time. Whenever Western Christianity was modified, adopted, accommodated or inculturated into Asian and Latin American traditional belief systems, there arose controversy about syncretism. ⁵⁴

Similarity between early Protestant missions in the Philippines and Latin America verifies historical and diachronic familiarity that had

⁴⁹ Harper, "Philippine Tongues of Fire?," p. 226 describes the characteristic of Latin American folk Catholicism.

⁵⁰ This is found in those regions where evangelization (i.e., Catholic evangelization), though it brought about a true religious change, met most resistance, owing to the tenacity and complexity of native religious traditions, as in the high cultures of the Andes and Mesoamerica, and black slaves in Brazil. Dussel, *The Church in Latin America* 1492-1992, p. 72.

⁵¹ This belongs to those parts of the continent where evangelization met with less resistance and where Roman Catholicism, especially in Chile and Paraguay, assimilated the native or black religious traditions.

⁵² This belongs to those parts of the continent occupied almost exclusively by emigrant Europeans, coming either as colonizers during the colonial period, or later as emigrants to already independent countries such as Argentina, Uruguay and Southern Brazil.

⁵³ They are full of emergent popular religions. Dussel, *The Church in Latin America* 1492-1992, pp. 71-73.

⁵⁴ Ma, "Asian (Classical) Pentecostalism: Theology in Context," pp. 4-5.

concentrated on medical missions and educational institutions. ⁵⁵ Similarities of P/C movements between Latin America and the Philippines are a common understanding of the Christian God, receptivity of baptism in the Holy Spirit and a regenerated believer through conversion experience from Roman Catholicism. ⁵⁶ The similarities and differences of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements between the Philippines and Latin America lie in historical, religious and cultural coincidence of Iberian colonization by the norms of Hispanic Catholicism. ⁵⁷ Dissimilarities are as follows, according to Harper:

The two regions have many things in common, but there are many things that set them apart as well. For example, Filipinos showed more resilience in the process of Hispanization than did the Aztecs, Incas and other aboriginal American peoples.

As David Martin points out, however, P/C movements in Korea seemingly have been "marked by schism and the canalization of spiritual power through rival charismatic leaders." Shamanism as a folk religion in Korea has to be dealt with by positive and negative functions, with theological and socio-religious evaluations by scholars, because the religiosity of Shamanism has been deeply interrelated with Christianity. This issue is quite controversial to judge for its function not only in Korean society, but also for world scholars. However, present argument on this appears in negative and positive ways with regard to indigenization, contextualization and inculturation.

⁵⁵ Harper, "Philippine Tongues of Fire?," p. 226.

⁵⁶ For similarities between Philippine and Latin American P/C beliefs, see Alvarez, "The South and the Latin American Paradigm of the Pentecostal Movement," pp. 141-42.

⁵⁷ Harper, "Philippine Tongues of Fire?," pp. 226-27.

⁵⁸ Martin, *Pentecostalism*, p. 161.

⁵⁹ Martin, *Pentecostalism*, p. 162 comments on shamanism are noteworthy: "It is with regard to shamanism that the ambiguities of indigenization are most obvious. The issue can be argued in several ways, so that shamanism can be positively valued as a female practice or as an expression of "the oppressed," and from such perspectives one would expect the Pentecostal adoption of (for example) pilgrimages to the prayer mountain to be applauded. Another aspect of indigenization is the distinctly Confucian interest in examination success, in mutual care and wellbeing, and the evident reverence for pastors. Of course, Pentecostalism is noted for its ability to "inculturate" but in the Korean case the

There is no doubt that Pentecostal scholars also admit to evaluating "the importance of the ancient Korean religious system, but also are aware of its dangers," as Allan Anderson raises the case. ⁶⁰ In positive response for this, Jae Bum Lee evaluates Shamanism as a way of spiritual preparedness for P/C movements, as an awareness of supernatural power, sins and evil spirits, and the need for blessings and healing are a great contribution preparing the way for Korean Protestant/Pentecostal church growth. ⁶¹

7. Political and Apolitical

Passive conformation has been a typical trend of Pentecostal church leadership to their secular governments in Asia and Latin America. However, this idea seems to be fading away. Instead the corporatist form of Protestantism and Pentecostalism is becoming a possible trend, according to Bastian:

Passive conformism, far from proving a kind of self-reflection of the religious counter-society, is in fact a major characteristic of the corporatist dynamics of contemporary forms of Protestantism in Latin America. For this reason over the last twenty years the Pentecostalist leadership in certain countries has become a political leadership in the traditional sense of corporatist mediation. 62

Many Charismatic leaders in the Philippines and Latin America are actively involved in politics. For example, Eddie Villanueva, the JIL leader in the Philippines, ran as a 2004 presidential candidate. Basic Community Churches that are prevalent in Latin America are also common in the Philippines. Therefore, whether due to sociopolitical

applause of other Korean Christians has been rather muted, even though they have themselves extensively adopted many features of the Pentecostal style."

⁶⁰ Anderson, "Pentecostalism in East Asia: Indigenous Oriental Christianity?," p. 131 states, "It may be appropriate to consider Korean Pentecostalism as a culturally indigenous form of Korean Christianity interacting with shamanism. Hong, "The Backgrounds and Characteristics of the Charismatic Mega-churches," p. 107 concurs with Anderson.

⁶¹ Young Hoon Lee, "Korean Pentecost: The Great Revival of 1907," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 4:1 (2001), pp. 73-83 (79). Anderson "Pentecostalism in East Asia: Indigenous Oriental Christianity?," p. 131.

⁶² Bastian, "Protestantism in Latin America," p. 345.

reasons or religious-spiritual motives, P/C scholars began to dialogue with conciliar-ecumenical leaders on the idea of social liberation. This is certainly the case in Korea, Brazil and some countries in Asia and Latin America.

Wonsuk Ma briefly states the understanding of Minjung and liberation theology as follows:

Unlike liberation theology, Minjung theology (its Korean cousin), or Dalit theology (the Indian attempt), has a starting point in the idea of a change in structure, the Pentecostal movement brought a spiritual dynamic to deprived lives....It is powerfully illustrious that a Latin American Pentecostal leader answered, when asked what is Pentecostal social program: "We are the program." It is no wonder that many reports indicate change in life style among Latin American Pentecostals, and this pattern is replicated in Asia. 63

As long as modern high-technology, economic development, and speedy globalization are working together from region to region, nation to nation, and continent to continent, twenty-first century Pentecostal/Charismatic followers will encounter complicated aspects of socio-religious-political-spiritual phenomena and they can share together more frequently through global, continental and regional networking, 64 and the spiritual dimension of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements should deal more with other issues such as socio-economic-religious-ecological matters as well. 65

The Philippine Roman Catholic Church has been a great powerhouse of politics with pastoral letters and ecclesiastical orders to the entire nation. The Church has a Base Community Church which can easily be mobilized politically. Traditional premillenialists from Pentecostal believers put their stance afar from politics, while newer and younger Charismatics feel free to be involved with their free-will decisions in political voting. The variety of political opinions and participations among P/C followers does not explain the mosaic differences in the Philippines. However, ordinary Evangelical Pentecostals appeared similar to Latin American Evangelicals according to Westmeier:

 $^{^{63}}$ Ma, "Asian (Classical) Pentecostalism: Theology in Context," p. 5.

 $^{^{64}}$ Alvarez, "The South and the Latin American Paradigm of the Pentecostal Movement," p. 140.

⁶⁵ Alvarez, "The South and the Latin American Paradigm of the Pentecostal Movement," p. 152.

David Stoll maintains that this model would be bound to engender fiction because, compared with the politically loaded agenda of Liberation Theology, Evangelicals could actually be seen as being apolitical in that, instead of struggling for structural changes via political action, their predominate concern is a message of personal regeneration—even though a social vision is embedded in this message. 66

Pentecostals and Charismatics are not obviously seen in politics on the issues of social and political reforms and programs, though they are actively involved in voting in politics in the Philippines.

No one knows how P/C reciprocal interaction could influence the masses of Filipinos who have been accustomed to the double-structured religious system; but it is obvious because of ancient religious beliefs and practices among folk/popular Catholics and some Protestants. P/C movements are not single-structured religious movements. These movements are rather interacting religious agents to produce dynamic and divergent religious reactions, ⁶⁷ and divergent P/C services are being held now in Greater Metro Manila to create new religious history for tomorrow.

⁶⁶ Westmeier, Protestant Pentecostalism in Latin America, p. 24.

⁶⁷ Rodrigo D. Tano, "Towards an Evangelical Asian Theology," in *The Bible and Theology in Asian Contexts: An Evangelical Perspective on Asian Theology*, eds. Bong Rin Ro and Ruth Eshenaur Ro (Seoul: Word of Life, 1991), pp. 93-118 (94-96).