In Search of Pentecostal Trajectories and Realities:
A Study of Hong Kong Assemblies of God Churches
by Christian Nathen Ng

Introduction

Hong Kong is a religiously pluralistic city, comprised of Christianity, Buddhism, Taoism, Islam, Hinduism, Sikhism, Judaism, Confucianism, Zoroastrianism, the Bahá’í Faith, and other religions. Although Pentecostal denominations are not the dominant Christian denominations in Hong Kong.

The latest government publication shows that religions in Hong Kong comprise Christianity (about 1.2 million adherents, including 800,000 Protestants and 404,000 Catholics), Buddhism (about 1 million adherents and over 400 temples), Taoism (over 1 million followers and over 300 Taoist abbeys and temples), Islam (about 300,000 Muslims, including 150,000 Indonesians, 50,000 Chinese, and 30,000 Pakistanis), Hinduism (about 100,000 adherents who are from India, Nepal, Sri Lanka, Thailand and other south-east Asian countries), Sikhism (about 12,000 Sikhs), Judaism, Confucianism, Zoroastrianism, and the Bahá’í Faith. This rough statistic entails that Christianity is not the overwhelmingly dominant religion in Hong Kong. Stuart M. I. Stoker, ed., Hong Kong 2020 (Hong Kong: Information Services Department of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government, 2021), 311–15.

For the purpose of analysis, the author regards the Pentecostal denominations as the classical Pentecostal denominations depicted by Allan H. Anderson in his taxonomy of global Pentecostalism in this paper. However, the term Pentecostalism is not confined to the classical Pentecostal denominations. This study adopts the definition of Pentecostalism depicted by Allan Heaton Anderson in his book To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity, in which “Pentecostalism” includes all those movements and churches where the emphasis is on an ecstatic experience of the Spirit and a tangible practice of spiritual gifts.” Allan Heaton Anderson, To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of World Christianity (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 8. Defining the term Pentecostalism varies, and the author is cognizant of the limitations and other possible ways of defining the term as well as the differences between the different types in Anderson’s typology. For the theoretical discussions on and approaches for defining global Pentecostalism, see Allan Anderson, “Varieties, Taxonomies, and Definitions,” in Studying Global Pentecostalism: Theories and Methods, eds. Allan Anderson, Michael Bergunder, André Droogers, and Cornelis van der Laan (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2010), 13–27.
Hong Kong,\(^3\) Hong Kong has the most diverse classical Pentecostal denominations among different Chinese regions.\(^4\) The early trajectory of Pentecostalism in Hong Kong is traceable to Alfred G. Garr (1874–1944) and Lillian Garr (1878–1916), who experienced the Azusa Street revival and were among the first to arrive in Hong Kong in 1907.\(^5\) Kay finds that apart from the Gars, early Pentecostal progress in Hong Kong is also traceable to Mattie Swan Ledbetter, who arrived in Hong Kong in about 1912 to conduct tent missions and evangelistic activities without any denominational backing.\(^6\) Ledbetter founded a Cantonese congregation that joined the American Assemblies of God in 1928.\(^7\)

**A Brief History of Assemblies of God in Hong Kong**

The Assemblies of God (AG) was founded in Hot Springs, Arkansas, by early Pentecostals who experienced the Azusa Street revival in 1914.\(^8\) The AG holds to the Finished Work tradition within classical Pentecostal denominations: Assemblies of God, Pentecostal Mission, Hong Kong & Kowloon, Kowloon Pentecostal Church, (The) Pentecostal Church of God Hong Kong (The Incorporated Trustees of the Pentecostal Church of God, Hong Kong and Macau), Hong Kong Pentecostal Holiness Church, International Church of the Foursquare Gospel Hong Kong District, The Chinese Full Gospel Church, and United Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong. As one of the Oneness Pentecostal denominations within Anderson’s proposed typology, True Jesus Church can be regarded as a classical Pentecostal denomination. However, whether True Jesus Church is a Pentecostal denomination is debatable. See, for example, Iap Sian-chin, “A Pioneer and Paradigm of Chinese Independent Pentecostal Churches: The Pentecostal Mission, Hong Kong and Kowloon,” *Logos & Pneuma: Chinese Journal of Theology*, no. 54 (Spring 2021): 86–90.

\(^3\) Quantitative Research Team of Alliance Bible Seminary, “The Distribution of the Congregations of the Twenty Major Denominations in Hong Kong,” *Alliance Bible Seminary*, 7 August 2014, 1–3.

\(^4\) Iap identifies eight Pentecostal denominations in Hong Kong and mentions their names in Chinese. See Iap Sian-chin, *The Latter Rain of the Spirit: Reorientation of the True Jesus Church with Special Reference to the Imagination and Representation of Global Pentecostal Studies* (New Taipei City, Taiwan: Taiwan Christian Literature Council and Taoyuan City, Taiwan: Research Center for Chinese Christianity, Chung Yuan Christian University, 2019), 91. Here are the English names of the identified Hong Kong classical Pentecostal denominations: Assemblies of God, Pentecostal Mission, Hong Kong & Kowloon, Kowloon Pentecostal Church, (The) Pentecostal Church of God Hong Kong (The Incorporated Trustees of the Pentecostal Church of God, Hong Kong and Macau), Hong Kong Pentecostal Holiness Church, International Church of the Foursquare Gospel Hong Kong District, The Chinese Full Gospel Church, and United Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong. As one of the Oneness Pentecostal denominations within Anderson’s proposed typology, True Jesus Church can be regarded as a classical Pentecostal denomination. However, whether True Jesus Church is a Pentecostal denomination is debatable. See, for example, Iap Sian-chin, “A Pioneer and Paradigm of Chinese Independent Pentecostal Churches: The Pentecostal Mission, Hong Kong and Kowloon,” *Logos & Pneuma: Chinese Journal of Theology*, no. 54 (Spring 2021): 86–90.


Pentecostalism.\textsuperscript{9} In 1916, a meeting was held by the early founders of the AG. AG pioneers decided to create a statement of faith “to regulate both religious experience and doctrinal beliefs.” There was eventually a statement of sixteen doctrinal beliefs for the AG that is consistent with what is now known as the Statement of Fundamental Truths. It emphasizes not only the fundamentalists’ basic beliefs but also “healing by the atonement and tongues as ‘initial evidence’ of Spirit baptism.”\textsuperscript{10} The AG has become “the world’s largest Pentecostal denomination, with over sixty million adherents and some 312,000 churches located in more than two hundred countries and territories.”\textsuperscript{11}

After Ledbetter’s arrival in Hong Kong, “although she probably died in the 1930s, the congregation she gathered continued to grow and thrive under Chinese leadership and is known as First Assembly of God in Hong Kong to this day.”\textsuperscript{12} During the Japanese occupation, AG missions faced a standstill. Eight AG missionaries were in Hong Kong at the time; almost all were interned in the Stanley Internment Camp. Later, they were repatriated in an exchange agreement between the US and Japan and returned to Hong Kong in 1945.\textsuperscript{13}

AG evangelism and social ministries progressively developed in different regions of Hong Kong after the war. Under the leadership of Harland Park, First Assembly of God (formerly known as the Argyle Street Church) decided to expand. In 1952, they purchased land for construction of a building seating 800 individuals and to extend its social ministries, including one elementary school with 450 children enrolled.\textsuperscript{14} Harold C. Herman (1902–1999), an AG missionary who ministered in forty-eight nations, launched an evangelistic crusade in Hong Kong in which he “preached continuously in various churches and outdoor meetings from October 1956 through January 1957.”\textsuperscript{15} In the campaign, 2,260 professions of faith were registered on decision cards. Several

\textsuperscript{9} Anderson, “Varieties, Taxonomies, and Definitions,” 17.

\textsuperscript{10} Poloma and Green, \textit{Assemblies of God}, 6–7. The Statement of Fundamental Truths consists of the 16 doctrines of the Assemblies of God. Most AG churches in Hong Kong follow the Statement of Fundamental Truths. The Assemblies of God 16 Fundamental Truths can be found on the official website of Assemblies of God (USA).

\textsuperscript{11} Ibid., 8.

\textsuperscript{12} Kay, “Missional education,” 202. The grave of Mattie Swan Ledbetter (1870–1938), recognized as a missionary of the AG, is located in the Hong Kong Cemetery. Ledbetter was born on 22 August 1870 and died on 4 March 1938.


hundred people prayed for salvation in meetings that Herman conducted at AG, Foursquare, and Pentecostal Mission churches with T. M. Sung, a Chinese pastor.\textsuperscript{16} The AG denomination experienced gradual church growth since the middle of the twentieth century.\textsuperscript{17}

In 2014, Hong Kong Assemblies of God (hereafter HKAG) celebrated the centennial of the AG and its arrival in China and Hong Kong. The Centennial was co-hosted by Ecclesia Ministries Limited, General Council of Hong Kong Assemblies of God, Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong (hereafter PCHK), and Asia Assembly Mission Council. Over forty AG churches, congregations, and institutions collaborated. The commemorative events, including Centennial Celebration Walkathon, 100 Days Prayer, and Centennial Celebrations, took place from July 2014 to November 2014.\textsuperscript{18} In 2020, the 5th International Pentecostal Conference was held by Ecclesia Ministries Limited from 24 June to 27 June. The conference, conducted in Chinese, promoted the Pentecostal movement in the Sinophone world as well as academic, pastoral, practical, and experiential exchanges between Pentecostal scholars, pastors, leaders, and adherents.\textsuperscript{19} In total, 113 local and foreign churches and organizations and 1,276 people from around the world participated in the conference.\textsuperscript{20}

\textbf{An Emic Story of Hong Kong Assemblies of God Churches}

In 2014, Ecclesia Theological Seminary, an AG seminary in Hong Kong, published a Chinese book written by HKAG pastoral leaders and adherents entitled, \textit{A Century of Assemblies of God China Mission – From South China to Hong Kong}, documenting the trajectories of the AG reaching from South China to Hong Kong. The stories of the churches possibly contain certain biases and subjectivity.\textsuperscript{21} Nevertheless, the book, especially the chapter authored by Lam Ngau Ming, is a

\textsuperscript{17}Kay, “Empirical and historical perspectives,” 17.
\textsuperscript{18}For more information about the Assemblies of God Centennial in Hong Kong, see the official website of the event: http://ag100.hk-ebc.edu/ (accessed 12 November 2021).
\textsuperscript{19}Editorial Team of Handbook of the 5th International Pentecostal Conference, ed., Handbook of the 5th International Pentecostal Conference (Hong Kong: Ecclesia Ministries Limited, 2020), 8.
\textsuperscript{21}For instance, one may argue that the authors of the book are inclined to adopt what Anderson calls the insider or emic paradigm and perceive the individual testimonies and accounts of healing and miracles different from the perspectives and approaches of etic observers, in which “emic and etic views always create such differences of viewpoint.” Anderson, “Varieties, Taxonomies, and Definitions,” 14–15.
valuable source. Accompanied by other sources, this study summarizes Lam’s chapter to trace the HKAG trajectories.

After Ledbetter died, due to a paucity of leadership, the AG sent missionaries Harland A. Park (1907–1971) and Catherine Elizabeth D. Park (1909–1961) to administer First Assembly of God Church in 1940. In post-war Hong Kong, under the leadership of H. A. Park, the church started to hold healing meetings and experienced gradual growth. In 2014, the mother church reached over a thousand people, with five congregations, one primary school, one kindergarten, and one nursery.\(^{22}\)

Many missionaries focused on church planting in city areas during the early twentieth century. Since the late 1930s, more focused on evangelism and church planting in rural areas of the New Territories. Churches founded during this time include Fanling Assembly of God Church, founded in 1940 by Lula Bell Hough (1906–2002), and a rural AG church now called Assemblies of God Holy Light Church, founded by a group of missionaries, including N. Cherry, and a Chinese Christian in the Yuen Long District in 1939 and joined by Sarah C. Johnston (1904–1972), Annie Bailie (1900–1986), and Poon Tai Koo.\(^{23}\) The missionaries, including Johnston, Bailie, and Hough, not only pioneered AG churches in cities and villages but also door-to-door evangelists in destitute areas.\(^{24}\)

After the war, American and Canadian AG missionaries departed from China and came to Hong Kong due to political tension in China.

---


\(^{23}\) Poon Tai Koo (1909–1995) is commonly known as the Chinese pastor and co-founder of New Territories Assemblies of God Church in the local AG circle. Regarding the name Poon Tai Koo, it was mentioned by Annie Bailie during her ministry in Hong Kong. See L. W. Smith, ed. followed by the rest of the entry. “Foreign Missions,” *The Pentecostal Evangel*, no. 2342 (March 1959): 11. It is possible that Tai Koo is not the first name in Cantonese since it can literally mean auntie. Poon Tai Koo possible refers to 潘大姑, whose Chinese name is 潘慈惠. The name of 潘慈惠 in English has remained unknown. This study uses the name Poon Tai Koo referring to 潘慈惠 or 潘大姑. The author of this study collected two documents related to the history of the church and other two documents related to the brief biographies of Annie Bailie and Poon Tai Koo from Cheng Siu Hung, one of the two ministers of New Territories Assemblies of God Church (Ping Shan), on 24 October 2021. According to the documents, Poon had closely worked with Annie Bailie in both China and Hong Kong for a long time. Apart from the documents, according to *The Pentecostal Evangel*, Bailie mentioned that she went to Pak Nai with a Bible woman called Tsz Nai, without mentioning her last name. See Annie Bailie, “In China Again,” *The Pentecostal Evangel*, no. 1723 (May 1947): 9. The Bible woman possibly refers to 潘慈惠 since Bailie and the woman had worked in Pak Nai during the same period. The author opines that although the last name of the Bible woman may be Poon, and although the name Poon Tsz Nai is consistent with 潘慈惠 in Cantonese, more evidence should be provided in order to confirm the real name of 潘慈惠 in English.

\(^{24}\) Lam, “Legacy of the Spirit,” 100–03.
The early missionaries, including Johnston, Bailie, Sadie McLeod (1915–1999), Blanche Pardo (1905–1979), and J. Elmor Morrison (1896–1965), devoted themselves to missions in Hong Kong. From the 1950s to the 1970s, due to increased demand for educational and social services among the lower-class people, the missionaries and Chinese Christians focused on planting churches, preaching the message of the full gospel, simultaneously conducting social and educational ministries.  

In 1953, McLeod and Pardo co-founded Assembly of God Shek Kip Mei Church, a historic AG church. They later co-founded Tuen Mun Assemblies of God Church in the New Territories and Assemblies of God West Point Church on Hong Kong Island. In 1954, with the assistance of Morrison, Siu Hoi Lei (1929–2010) also started evangelism and Bible and Chinese learning classes for children in Hong Lok Sun Chuen. The ministry “expanded into the fields of education and social services” in different locations, such as Wong Tai Sin, Tung Tau Estate, Wang Tau Hom, Ngau Tau Kok, and Diamond Hill. In 1964, Siu officially founded and registered PCHK, an independent AG denomination as a non-profit organization.  

Carmichael mentions that Hough and Bailie supervised churches and schools in the New Territories after the war. In fact, Poon Tai Koo, a Chinese woman recognized as a Bible woman in the Western AG circle but recognized as a pastor in local AG circles, also played a significant role in missions in the New Territories. In the early 1950s, New Territories Assemblies of God Church, which currently consists of three congregations, and Wai Kwan Primary School were co-founded by Bailie and Poon in Ping Shan, gradually penetrating the rural areas since the middle of the twentieth century. Assemblies of God Wa Wai Church was founded by A. Walker Hall (1908–1990) and Nell Funk (1909–2004) in the 1960s. Like Siu, the Halls started their mission, especially educational ministries, in the resettlement areas in 1963. From the 1960s to the 1970s, the church had conducted evangelism in various impecunious residential communities, such as Kwun Tong, Lam Tin, and Sau Mau Ping. Since the 1980s, the church has adopted megachurch and cell group models and contemporary worship music.
Many HKAG churches had both global and local visions. Originating in Kam Tin, Yuen Long Kam Kwong Church has transformed from a village church into a megachurch in the center of Yuen Long Town. It is now the largest HKAG church, and planted its affiliated congregations in Los Angeles, Nepal, and Singapore.\(^{32}\)

International Christian Assembly (ICA) was founded in the early 1970s by Otis (1927–1997) and Irene Keener to evangelize the non-Chinese speaking groups in Hong Kong. ICA was one of the earliest English-speaking HKAG churches. It expanded its language ministries to include Sri Lankan, Indonesian, Nepali, Putonghua, Brazilian, Tamil, and Hindi. In 2014, ICA had over 30 weekly worship services at seven locations, with over 4,500 in attendance in Hong Kong.\(^{33}\) Kay notes that ICA contains 12 congregations and “is organised into 60 home groups.”\(^{34}\)

**Mapping Hong Kong Assemblies of God Churches**

There are four main HKAG associations within this largest Pentecostal denomination in Hong Kong: Ecclesia Ministries Limited, PCHK, General Council of Hong Kong Assemblies of God, and Asia Assembly Mission Council. Most HKAG associations and churches are members of Ecclesia Ministries Limited.\(^ {36}\) PCHK contains seven congregations.\(^ {37}\) The General Council of Hong Kong Assemblies of God

---

\(^{32}\)Ibid., 136.

\(^{33}\)Ibid., 142–46.

\(^{34}\)Kay, “Empirical and historical perspectives,” 17.

\(^{35}\)It depends on how one defines the largest classical Pentecostal denomination.

Based on the author’s observation, HKAG has the most congregations and churches in Hong Kong. Other large classical Pentecostal denominations in Hong Kong include Hong Kong Pentecostal Holiness Church, which has fourteen congregations and one small planted congregation associated with the congregation called Pentecostal Holiness Church Rousseau Memorial Assembly, International Church of the Foursquare Gospel Hong Kong District, which contains seven congregations, and True Jesus Church in Hong Kong, which consists of eight churches.

\(^{36}\)Ecclesia Ministries Limited currently comprises seven members, including Asia Assembly Mission Council, Assemblies of God Wa Wai Church, Christian Gospel Church of Love, New Territories Assemblies of God Church, Assemblies of God Holy Light Church, Ministry on the Rock, and Chinese Christian Workers’ Fellowship. As of November 2014, Ecclesia Ministries Limited also comprised other independent churches: Yuen Long Kam Kwong Church, Assemblies of God West Point Church, International Christian Assembly, Tuen Mun Assemblies of God Church, Assembly of God Paul Church, Hong Kong City Church, and Kingdom Pioneers Assembly. For the list of HKAG churches as of November 2014, see Edmund Tak-ming Cheung, ed., *A Century of Assemblies of God China Mission – From South China to Hong Kong* (Hong Kong: Ecclesia Bible College, 2014), 156–57.

\(^{37}\)PCHK currently comprises seven congregations in Hong Kong, including Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong Chuk Yuen Church (PCHK Chuk Yuen Church),
has several member churches. The Chinese Christian Assemblies of God contains two congregations.

Other AG churches include Assembly of God Shek Kip Mei Church, Shatin Assembly of God Church, and Assembly of God Caleb Church. As of November 2014, there were forty-six HKAG churches in the three main regions of Hong Kong, including twenty-seven in the New Territories, fifteen in Kowloon, and four on Hong Kong Island. In 2015, Kingdom Pioneers Assembly merged with Youthquake Christian Church, becoming Ambassador Assembly.

Questions Derived from the Myths of Pentecostalism

Miller and Yamamori point out three Pentecostal stereotypes commonly rooted in individuals’ minds. They clarify that “while Pentecostals believe in the Holy Spirit, worship services are not always populated with people being slain in the spirit, speaking in tongues, prophesying, and having their crutches thrown away by faith healers.”

They point out the second Pentecostal stereotype “that Pentecostals are lower-class, marginalized people for whom religion is an opiate” as well as the third stereotype “that Pentecostals are so heavenly minded that they are of no earthly good.” However, “while there is some truth to each of these three perceptions, the reality is much more complex.”

Since many scholars and researchers have responded to these stereotypes, this study does not offer straightforward responses to such
over-generalizations. Rather, it will investigate the realities and trajectories of HKAG churches, starting with questions that compare the churches with stereotypes of Pentecostalism and extract a set of questions from stereotypes of Pentecostalism as a starting point to investigate and reveal the realities and trajectories of HKAG churches. First, to what extent are their worship and spiritual practices consistent with the typical images of Pentecostalism? Second, in the case of HKAG churches, who are the congregations and what are their roles in the churches? Finally, how do they respond to society or to their residential communities? The study’s findings are based on case studies of HKAG churches who responded to these questions. The following discussions involve some cases of HKAG churches responding to the questions.

**Worship and Spiritual Manifestations in the Churches**

Historically, “early Pentecostal worship gatherings were marked by the creation of space for people to be baptized in the Holy Spirit with the evidence of speaking in tongues.” However, nowadays, the forms and styles of Pentecostal worship services vary, and Pentecostals do not necessarily speak in tongues during worship rituals. These practices happen in some Pentecostal churches, but some churches prefer to practice spiritual gifts in small group meetings or on special occasions.

Yuen Long Kam Kwong Church holds one Sunday morning prayer meeting and ten worship services every week. On Sundays, thousands attend the worship services. Before the Sunday worship services, the church holds the morning prayer meetings with over one thousand participants. The church embraces praying or speaking in tongues and contemporary and popular Christian music in its worship services. Its public worship is emotional, interactive, and mercurial. During worship

---


46. Miller, “Progressive Pentecostalism,” 278.

47. One worship service for adults on Friday, three worship services for the elderly, secondary school students, and young adults respectively on Saturday, and six worship services, including one service for the youth, two services for adults, and two services for children, and one service held in Kam Tin Church, located in Kam Tin Main Road, on Sunday.

services, most congregation members are jubilant and typically applaud, lift up their hands, cry out, and speak in tongues. Worship leaders interact with the congregations and lead prayers in tongues. During cell group meetings, the congregations also practice the same.

A former member, who attended Kam Kwong Church for ten years, reveals that speaking in tongues is a very common phenomenon in the church and claims that almost all members would pray or speak in tongues during worship and prayer sections. The regular worship services and divine healing services were typically held separately. During the public healing meeting, the prayer section would last longer, and the congregations would be asked to lift up their hands to pray for and ask for divine healing for those who have serious diseases.

First Assembly of God Church provides similar worship services, but it has a strong preference for contemporary Cantonese and Chinese worship music rather than English worship music. Its congregation members are encouraged to lift up their hands and sing praise to God during public worship. Speaking in tongues can be observed during its worship sections. AG churches like Kam Kwong Church and First Assembly of God Church clearly embrace Pentecostal spirituality and traditionalism.

In contrast, the services of New Territories Assemblies of God Church (Ping Shan) are less emotional and interactive. The church prefers contemporary Cantonese worship music to globally popular worship music, though the latter plays an indirect role in the services. The congregations of Ping Shan Church are generally quiet and passive during the services. During the cell group meetings, the author observed that the cell members sang very quietly during worship and did not speak in tongues during the meetings.

---

49 Anonymous 1, Private conversation, 7 November 2021.
50 For example, in 2018, there were three public healing services held in the church, namely ‘The 6th Kam Kwong Healing Crusade’ on 31 March 2018, ‘The 7th Kam Kwong Healing Crusade’ on 6 October 2018, and ‘The 8th Kam Kwong Healing Crusade’ on 15 December 2018. See Celia Hui, ed., Kam Kwong Post 63 (December 2018), 8.
51 Anonymous 1, Private conversation, 7 November 2021.
52 For instance, on 7 November 2021, during the first Sunday service at 9:00 am, the pastor kneeled on the floor and started praying or speaking in tongues during the worship section after the sermon.
53 Wilson Ip, one of the two ministers of Ping Shan Church, has translated many global Christian worship songs produced by famous Christian music bands or producers, such as Hillsong Worship, Bethel Music, Joshua Band, and Stream of Praise Music Ministries, into Cantonese. The church sometimes performs these translated songs in the worship services.
54 The author visited New Territories Assemblies of God Church (Ping Shan), located in Ping Shan, and attended its Sunday worship services from July 2021 to
Cheng Siu Hung, one of two ministers of Ping Shan Church, asserts that the church does not emphasize charismatic manifestations such as glossolalia, especially during public worship. Cheng opines that the church is open to the working of the Spirit, and speaking in tongues is not prohibited because it belongs to the AG tradition. However, he also notes that the church, as a conservative Pentecostal church, is inclined to the Evangelical tradition: seeking the truth is more important than charismatic manifestations. He deems that speaking in tongues has been controversial among different Christian traditions in Hong Kong since the 1980s, and the spiritual manifestations may create misunderstanding or public fear of others.55

Similarly, Assembly of God Chapel of Praise does not emphasize speaking in tongues in its services, nor does it have a strong preference for English worship music in its public worship services. Like many Pentecostal churches, its worship services begin with cheerful and passionate contemporary Cantonese and Chinese worship songs and end with emotional and touching worship music. During the worship, the worship team occasionally interacts with the congregations, instructing people to pray and clap their hands. Yet, the collective manifestation of speaking in tongues among both worship team members and congregations is absent.56

Lau Wai Yip, the senior pastor of Chapel of Praise, reveals that the church has never pursued the gifts of the Spirit throughout its history. Lau mentions that the early church pioneers did not really have ecstatic experiences of the Spirit and that the congregations find the spiritual gifts very weird. They do not expect spiritual manifestations to occur in the church. However, he wants to restore the identity of his church as a Pentecostal church with spiritual gifts and divine healing. Under his leadership, the church has held seasonal conferences promoting Pentecostalism and courses that introduce Pentecostal theology, histories of Pentecostalism, and spiritual gifts.57

Ingalls mentions that currently, “diverse yet recognizable expressions of corporate worship and music making are hallmark features of pentecostal spirituality across the broad reach of the movement.”58 However, unlike Kam Kwong Church and First Assembly November 2021 as well as one of its cell group meetings three times at a house of the church member from October 2021 to November 2021.

55Cheng Siu Hung, Interview, 7 November 2021.
56The author visited Assembly of God Chapel of Praise, located in Sheung Shui, and attended four Sunday services of the church in November 2021.
57Lau Wai Yip, Interview, 21 November 2021.
of God Church, Ping Shan Church seeks to privatize spiritual practices and does not expect public spiritual manifestations to avoid potential theological conflicts and any misunderstanding from others. Evangelistic-Charismatic dualism is a mainstream discourse within local Christian circles. Many classify different churches into two categories, namely Evangelical tradition and Charismatic tradition, based on whether the churches practice charismata (especially glossolalia) and whether the churches encourage their congregations to pursue the ecstatic experiences of the Spirit. 59

In Hong Kong, many Evangelical churches have published official statements to impugn the Charismatic movement and spiritual gifts. Certainly, Hong Kong is not the only Chinese context where Christians are sensitive to the term Charismatic. 60 Due to the theological controversy over spiritual gifts, Pentecostal churches like Ping Shan Church tend to privatize spiritual practices. However, interestingly, Chapel of Praise seems to pursue ‘re-Pentecostalization.’ While Ping Shan Church does not emphasize the spiritual gifts and Pentecostal identity, Chapel of Praise intends to reshape the congregational understanding of the spiritual manifestations and restore the centennial Pentecostal legacy. Re-Pentecostalization may serve as an alternative reality for Pentecostal churches, such as Chapel of Praise, which struggle with Pentecostal tradition to restore spiritual manifestations and reshape their Pentecostal identity.

---

59 In the Chinese context, Charismatic tradition often refers to lingenpai or ling’en pai that may have a negative connotation to many Pentecostal churches. They and many Chinese churches having some ling’en in their beliefs and practices often refuse to be labelled as lingenpai jiaohui (Charismatic churches). See, for example, Fenggang Yang, Joy K. C. Tong, and Allan H. Anderson, eds. Global Chinese Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity (Leiden: Brill, 2017).

60 In his study of Pentecostal-Charismatic Christianity in contemporary China, Liu finds that Chinese Christians generally intend to perceive Charismatic Christianity as heresy or cult, and those Chinese Christians having some Charismatic traits often regard their traits as spiritual traits instead of Charismatic traits. Chinese church leaders and adherents having the spiritual traits do not like to be called either Pentecostals or Charismatics. His study of the spiritual churches in Henan clearly reveals this phenomenon. Liu Yi, Global Pentecostalism & Local Christianity: A Life History (New Taipei City, Taiwan: Taiwan Christian Literature Council and Taoyuan City, Taiwan: Research Center for Chinese Christianity, Chung Yuan Christian University, 2018), 15, 83, 159–60, 181.
Complexity and Hybridity of Pentecostal Congregations:  
A Case Study

There is not sufficient evidence to assert that Pentecostals are destitute and marginalised. Historically, this was quite true.\(^{61}\) However, the circumstances have changed. Suico noted:

As Pentecostal membership worldwide is no longer strictly confined to the poorest of the poor, it now has within its ranks people from a wide range of socio-economic and educational backgrounds. Already there is a growing number of Pentecostals taking higher education and actively involved in various forms of academic disciplines.\(^{62}\)

The case study of Yuen Long Kam Kwong Church exemplifies the complexity and hybridity of HKAG congregations, but is not a generalization of the realities of all HKAG churches.

The demographic of Kam Kwong Church is complex and hybrid. Many congregations are university students, well-educated young adults, professionals, and wealthy people. Yet, its congregational structure is not haphazard. Instead, it is structurally stratified. Like numerous Pentecostal churches, Kam Kwong Church generally divides its congregations into several zones by age, such as Youth Zone, Tertiary Zone, Young Adult Zone, and Adult Zone. Congregations may not share similar socio-economic backgrounds but are arranged into ‘Family-based’ groups led by Family Pastors. In each Family, zones are led by zone leaders and further divided into cell groups led by cell leaders. The church also has specialized professional fellowships which are programs based on different professions.\(^{63}\)

Kam Kwong Church members can devote themselves to the church services by voluntarily joining service teams such as the Translation Team, Worship Team, and Audio Visual Team. The youth ministry team, called the Joyful & Peaceful Team (JP Team), includes university and

---

63In 2018, the Professional Fellowships comprised Businessmen Fellowship, Disciplinary Force Fellowship, Accounting and Finance Fellowship, Medical and Healthcare Fellowship, Education Fellowship, and Social Service Fellowship, and each of these fellowships was led by an elite, professional, or expert. In 2019, the inauguration of the Engineers Fellowship was announced. Fun Lee, ed., Kam Kwong Post 58 (February 2018), 5; Celia Hui, ed., Kam Kwong Post 68 (October 2019), 11.
secondary school students. Its publication shows that from June 2019 to August 2019, the JP Team had reached over 5,700 lives, and over 580 of them were converted. The purpose of its youth ministry is to “win the campus today, win the world tomorrow.” They reached different groups of people and visited a variety of housing estates, primary schools, and secondary schools.\textsuperscript{64}

The members with professions and youth members of Kam Kwong Church exemplify that they have been spiritually transformed, blessed by God, and become the outstanding and fully-committed Christians who are called to bring love and hope to different groups of individuals. Their narratives and personal stories testify how spiritual transformation has led them to rethink the meaning of life and further pursue their dreams for God. Noel notes, “Pentecostals instinctively recognized the power of the individual story as a means of connecting communities and communicating truth, much as postmoderns today value the same.”\textsuperscript{65} In the case of Kam Kwong Church the mobilization for evangelism of energetic and zealous adherents, especially university students and professionals, seems effective. By epitomizing themselves as Spirit-transformed Christians, the adherents influence or convert individuals with similar backgrounds and struggles.

**Social Engagement**

In the eyes of many Christians, the separation of the spiritual and secular is embedded into the mindsets of Pentecostals. Dermawan notes that such “otherworldliness implies simple dualism between the world and heaven.” Their ‘heavenly’-mindedness leads Pentecostals “to focus only on such activities which they consider as spiritual,” such as saving souls, and they “neglect activities that are considered as secular.”\textsuperscript{66} Suico also points out that “although Pentecostals believe their message is relevant to people and to the larger society, they have also been perceived as indifferent toward social, economic and political issues.”\textsuperscript{67} Historically, as Smith points out, “Pentecostals were largely apolitical and otherworldly.”\textsuperscript{68} However, Smith finds that “global Pentecostalism has

\textsuperscript{64}Celia Hui, ed., *Kam Kwong Post 67* (August 2019), 1.
\textsuperscript{65}Bradley Truman Noel, *Pentecostalism, Secularism, and Post Christendom* (Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2015), 159.
\textsuperscript{67}Suico, “Pentecostalism and Social Change,” 198.
moved on from the apolitical and otherworldly stereotype” and that “without losing their sense of the heavenly, Pentecostals, by and large, are thoroughly this-worldly, practical and concerned with the here and now, engaging the political and economic spheres at various levels.”

Brandner provides examples of Pentecostal interaction with the public sphere of Hong Kong, ranging from traditional public ministry, including social and educational services, to direct political participation. HKAG churches have consistently and actively engaged in social services and political issues. Kam Kwong Integrated Community Service Center - Yuen Long (KKICSC), the social service center of Kam Kwong Church, has launched various creative social ministry activities to serve families in need, cancer patients, the elderly, and ethnic minorities. It also empowers the powerless to serve their neighbours by recruiting cancer survivors, tutorial school owners, university students, and registered and retired social workers, to join the team, in order “to bring love and care into the community and serve the disadvantaged groups with the love of Christ.”

Its social enterprise project ‘Dream Home Artistry’ serves as an opportunity for women and teenagers to serve schools and social institutions with talents such as design, photography, makeup, and performance. Project tutors include housewives, people with physical disabilities, adolescents seeking employment, and ethnic minorities. A pastor of Kam Kwong Church notes, 

Today, if we desire to live a life “to love our neighbour” and “truly” help others, it is a must to “touch the hearts” of the people in order to understand the needs of them. The example of the Samaritan shows us that we have to be filled with compassion and also taking action to reach out to those who are in need. This is how we should serve and become a true neighbour.

72 Fun Lee, ed., Kam Kwong Post 60 (July 2018), 10.
73 Celia Hui, ed., Kam Kwong Post 63 (December 2018), 7.
74 Amanda Ng, “Who is the True Neighbour?” Kam Kwong Post 65 (April 2019), 1.
Meanwhile, the messages of repentance, confession, and the working of the Spirit preached by the pastoral leaders have deeply penetrated the congregations.75

PCHK also offers diverse social ministries. It has provided poor children with schooling services since the 1950s.76 PCHK has two departments specializing in two types of ministries: the Education Department with both primary and secondary schooling services, and the Social Welfare Department, which governs the social service institutions.77 The church “aim[s] at spreading the gospel and promoting the welfare of the Hong Kong community in order to achieve the ultimate goal of glorifying God and benefiting men.”78

The recent annual report of PCHK shows that it has allocated significant resources to its social services, including the recruitment of more professionals in its three nursery schools. Its model of cross-professional cooperation for the nursery schools utilizes individuals with a variety of professions and occupations, such as an educational psychologist, an occupational therapist, a speech therapist, a school nurse, school social workers, a full-time native English teacher, a full-time Mandarin teacher, preschool teachers, and special child care workers. In September 2020, the Social Welfare Department of PCHK established two service units: the TARGET Diverse Development Centre79 and the Whole Person Training Centre. The former deployed a cross-profession team to run, design and lead activities for students with special educational needs. From August to October 2020, the latter offered a certificate program to equip the church staff with knowledge and skills to provide professional support for such children.80 Some AG churches, such as Kam Kwong Church and PCHK, intensively diversify their social ministries, while others specialize in theirs. For example,

---

76 For a brief historical background of PCHK and its educational ministries, see Rhoda Chan, “The Establishment and Development of Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong,” in 60th Anniversary Booklet of Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, ed. Rhoda Chan (Hong Kong: Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, 2014), 12–15.
77 Two primary schools, Assembly of God Leung Sing Tak Primary School and Assembly of God St. Hilary’s College, and one secondary school, Assembly of God Hebron Secondary School, operate under the Education Department. Social service institutions, include four elderly centres, three nursery schools, one family centre, one sheltered workshop, and a hostel. These operate under the Social Welfare Department, which also provides other social services. For the organization chart of PCHK, see Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, Annual Report 2018-2020, 8.
78 Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, Annual Report 2018-2020, 2.
79 TARGET: Teach, Assist, Reach, God, Establish, and Transform.
since the beginning, New Territories Assemblies of God Church has particularly focused on educational ministries among the poor. Oberg notes,

In Hong Kong, [Bailie] helped to establish and operate four schools, provided scholarships to young Christians, and returned to the ministry of hospital visitation and tract distribution like she had done in her early years in Pennsylvania. Many were saved, healed, encouraged, and filled with the Spirit due to her loving ministry.\(^{81}\)

Historically, the educational ministries of church founders preceded the establishment of the church.\(^{82}\) Similarly, Fanling Assembly of God Church also emphasizes the educational ministries as well as other social ministries.\(^{83}\) Although it has mainly served the communities in Fanling, its schools (Assembly of God Union Church Kindergarten and Christian Little Tree Kindergarten), have reached Sha Tin, the New Territories, and Ngau Tau Kok, Kowloon respectively. These cases challenge Pentecostal stereotypes and exemplify the diversity and continuity of their social ministries.

**Political Engagement in the Current Context**

In 2019, the anti-extradition law amendment bill movement occurred in Hong Kong. After the Government proposed the Fugitive Offenders and Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Legislation (Amendment) Bill 2019, different activists quickly responded to the announcement arguing for or against the bill. On 26 May 2019, a group of AG adherents initiated a petition to express their concern that the

---


\(^{82}\) Cheng, Interview, 7 November 2021. For a brief description of different educational ministries provided by Bailie, Johnston, and Poon since the post-war context of Hong Kong, see Lam, “Legacy of the Spirit,” 124–26.

\(^{83}\) Several schools are associated with Fanling Assembly of God Church: Assembly of God Union Church Kindergarten, Christian Little Tree Kindergarten, The Fanling Assemblies of God Kindergarten, Fanling Assembly of God Church Grace Light Kindergarten, Fanling Assembly of God Church Grace Light Child Care Centre, and Fanling Assembly of God Church Primary School. Fanling Assembly of God Church Grace Light Kindergarten and Fanling Assembly of God Church Grace Light Child Care Centre are currently combined as Fanling Assembly Of God Church Grace Light Kindergarten and Child Care Centre, located in the same place in Fanling, the New Territories. Fanling Assembly of God Church has also provided a variety of social services through Fanling Assembly of God Church Social Services Department.
Government had overlooked public voices of skepticism and opposition and to urge the Government to value public opinion.

As socio-political tensions continued, on 20 July 2019, fifty-eight individuals, including AG pastors, leaders, and adherents, initiated a petition condemning the Government and proposing the five requests. By referring to Romans 13:1-7 and 1 Peter 2:13-17, the initiators insisted that the authority on earth belonged to God and should maintain social justice and peace, and the churches should warn or even condemn the authority when it went wrong. On 10 December 2020, four Christian groups, including a group of AG adherents, initiated a petition showing support for Good Neighbour North District Church as the initiators believed the church had been oppressed by the Government.

Many HKAG churches have devoted themselves to social ministries and evangelism simultaneously, and some have professionalized their social ministries. Professionalization of the social ministries helps churches build up a professional image. It empowers them to serve not only the poor but also people with complex needs, penetrating different social communities and becoming part of their residential ecology. Miller notes,

Historically, it is true that Pentecostals were very other-worldly, with many of their members evangelising their neighbours as they waited expectantly for the imminent return of Christ. This other-worldly characteristic of Pentecostalism, however, is changing. There is an emergent group of Pentecostals who are pursuing the integral or holistic gospel in response to what they see as the example of Jesus who ministered both to people’s physical needs as well as preached about the coming Kingdom of God.

Miller and Yamamori call them Progressive Pentecostals and their emergent movement Progressive Pentecostalism. Progressive Pentecostal churches are programmatic in their social ministries, and “their social ministries are available to everyone in the community and, therefore, they are not simply incentives for people to convert to Christianity or join their church.”

---

84Namely the official withdrawal of the extradition bill, retraction of the classification of protesters as the rioters, establishment of an independent commission of inquiry into alleged police brutality, cessation of all searches and prosecutions which would spread the White Terror, and demand of holding the chief executive and principal officials accountable.

85Miller, “Progressive Pentecostalism,” 278.

86Miller and Yamamori, Global Pentecostalism, 2.

87Miller, “Progressive Pentecostalism,” 280.
inclined toward Progressive Pentecostalism, though they may not be de facto Progressive Pentecostal churches. The urgency of social problems and crises has long concerned them. Some Pentecostal churches do not see that the work of the Spirit takes place in a socio-political arena.\footnote{Kung points out that the Pentecostals and Evangelicals “understand the work of the Spirit chiefly on an individual level” and “see that the work of the Spirit mainly takes place within the ecclesial (institutional) context, not in a socio-political arena.” Lap-yan Kung, “Outpouring of the Spirit: A Reflection on Pentecostals’ Identity,” \textit{Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies} 4, no. 1 (January 2001): 8.} Some never speak of social issues because they are inclined to otherworldliness.\footnote{Lap-yan Kung, “Globalization, Ecumenism and Pentecostalism: A Search for Human Solidarity in Hong Kong,” \textit{Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies} 6, no. 1 (January 2003): 117.} However, numerous HKAG churches have focused on social ministries and directly participated in the political realm. Brandner observes that “the idea of standing at a crossroads is a common feature of scholarly discussions of Pentecostalism.”\footnote{Brandner, “Public Sphere,” 135.} Similarly, HKAG churches are standing at a crossroads.

**Conclusion**

Although this study could not comprehensively depict the realities of all HKAG churches, the case studies demonstrate that HKAG churches have multifaceted trajectories in social ministries. They have experienced the efforts of foreign and local missionaries throughout a century and have diverse understandings of Pentecostal spirituality and traditions. Although the churches are denominational and share commonalities, their multifaceted trajectories and realities make them peculiar and unique as they serve all for God.
Bibliography


Chan, Rhoda. “The Establishment and Development of Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong.” In *60th Anniversary Booklet of Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong* [In Chinese], edited by Rhoda Chan, 12–15. Hong Kong: Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, 2014.


Iap, Sian-chin. *The Latter Rain of the Spirit: Reorientation of the True Jesus Church with Special Reference to the Imagination and Representation of Global Pentecostal Studies* [In Chinese]. New Taipei City, Taiwan: Taiwan Christian Literature Council and Taoyuan City, Taiwan: Research Center for Chinese Christianity, Chung Yuan Christian University, 2019.  


Kay, William K. “Missional education: lessons from Southeast Asia.” *Journal of the European Pentecostal Theological*


Ng, Amanda. "Who is the True Neighbour?" Kam Kwong Post 65 (April 2019): 1.


Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong. Annual Report 2018-2020 [In
Chinese]. Hong Kong: Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, 2020.
Poloma, Margaret M., and John C. Green. The Assemblies of God: 
Godly Love and the Revitalization of American Pentecostalism. 
Quantitative Research Team of Alliance Bible Seminary. “The 
Distribution of the Congregations of the Twenty Major 
Denominations in Hong Kong” [In Chinese]. Alliance Bible 
Seminary, 7 August 2014, 1–3.
Ríos, Elizabeth D. “‘The Ladies Are Warriors’: Latina Pentecostalism 
and Faith-Based Activism in New York City.” In Latino Religions 
and Civic Activism in the United States, edited by Gastón 
Espinosa, Virgilio Elizondo, and Jesse Miranda, 197–217. New 
Smith, Calvin L. “The Politics and Economics of Pentecostalism: A 
Global Survey.” In The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism, 
edited by Cecil M. Robeck, Jr. and Amos Yong, 175–94. New 
Smith, L. W., ed. "Foreign Missions." The Pentecostal Evangel, no 
2342 (March 1959): 4-11.
Stoker, Stuart M. I., ed. Hong Kong 2020. Hong Kong: Information 
Services Department of the Hong Kong Special Administrative 
Suico, Joseph L. “Pentecostalism and Social Change.” Asian Journal 
Tang, Rita. "Review of KKICSC." Kam Kwong Post 70 (December 
Wu, Wai Hung. “Social Service Chief Executive’s Report.” In Annual 
Report 2018-2020 [In Chinese], edited by Pentecostal Church of 
Hong Kong, 5–7. Hong Kong: Pentecostal Church of Hong Kong, 
2020.
Yang, Fenggang, Joy K. C. Tong, and Allan H. Anderson, eds. Global 
Chinese Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity. Leiden: Brill, 
2017.